

**MINUTES  
PAYETTE CITY COUNCIL  
REGULAR MEETING  
July 21, 2008**

**6:30 PM Public Hearing**

- A. **The City of Payette will hold a public hearing to gather information on current and future water infrastructure needs on July 21, 2008, at 6:00 PM in Payette City Hall Council Chambers, 700 Center Avenue, Payette, Idaho. The public is invited and encouraged to attend.**

Gene Lancaster 11428 Scotch Pines Rd, Payette, ID-

Mr. Lancaster thanked the council for taking the time to discuss a critical issue that will ultimately determine the economic strength of Payette. The topic of water line construction is not a glamorous or exciting subject, but the fact is water lines should be installed and then forgotten. The general public is typically unaware of what types of water lines deliver their water; they turn on their faucet and expect crystal clear and healthy drinking water. Developers who pay for and install the lines need to utilize modern building materials that enable them to build the infrastructures, utilizing the best available materials while still remaining competitive with other developments in the neighboring communities. The topic of water line construction boils down to two main issues. Do the water lines deliver clean clear healthy drinking water, do they deliver the longest life span, utilize readily available building materials that are cost effective to purchase, install, and maintain. So why are we all here today to discuss water line construction in the City of Payette, because it is clear the above criteria are not being met. For years the City of Payette has by ordinance mandated the use of Ductile Iron water lines, we have been told how the City had a Cadillac water supply system. It's true that the City is mandating the absolute most expensive water lines on the planet, but are we actually getting Cadillac quality water delivered to the citizens of Payette. I spent the last several days talking to Payette residents and some business owners, and I have yet to encounter anybody who thinks the drinking water in this City is clear, and good to drink. In fact I have found that the mass majority of people won't drink the water as it is yellow and full of iron. You have been provided with information packets outlining the pros and cons of Ductile Iron vs. PVC. I'd like to highlight a few of those facts. In 1998 US Congress authorized a study to calculate the impact of line corrosion on the US economy. The two year study determined that the direct cost of water and sewer system corrosion \$36 billion dollars annually. That figure does not include the indirect cost of consequences resulting from corroded pipe failure. Those consequences can be catastrophic, service disrupted, street cave-ins, and flooding. Business and traffic are often severely disrupted, sometimes for prolonged periods of time, and residence can be forced to evacuate their homes. Some pipe failures have prompted extended boil water notices, creating a real potential for public health crisis. The study also determined corrosion is the single largest reason water lines fail. In a 1994 survey sponsored by the American Water works Association Research Foundation responding facilities gave PVC a life expectancy rating of 4.1 on a scale of 1-5, which was unsurpassed by any other pipe material. A two year study conducted by the Nation Research Council of Canada found that for each 100 kilometers of water distribution pipe laid, PVC had only had .7 (7/10) breaks per year compared to 35.9 breaks for Cast Iron, and 9.5 breaks for Ductile Iron. PVC water lines have been adopted by over 95% of the municipalities in Idaho. PVC water lines do not corrode from the inside out like Ductile Iron lines do, thus have a longer lifespan, and don't require the City Water Department to spend time and money flushing the lines. PVC lines deliver far superior water quality as they do not corrode and add high concentrations of iron through the water supply. Ductile Iron water lines require a constant costly maintenance process called flushing. Flushing is the process to flush out the deposits of corroded iron in the lines; it is of costly and inefficient process that wastes City water department time and water. The EPA also warns that flushing lines can release large amounts of scale and accumulated deposits into the water system, bringing water quality to unacceptable and unhealthy levels. You were

also presented a table in the frequently asked questions section of the document that outlines the economic impact of Ductile Iron lines on future developments. I would like to highlight some of this information. The cost of Ductile Iron water lines has merely doubled in the last 6 months; it is expected to continue to increase at a rate of over 30% annually due to the increase demand for iron in China. For phase one of our proposed development Gold ridge Estates one 9 lot phase. This difference in water line costs alone is \$100,000, or \$3,500 dollars per building lot. It is simply impossible to pass this much cost on to the end buyer, and thus Gold ridge Estate will have to be put on hold until this issue is resolved. Let me be clear this issue in my opinion if not resolved is the end of development and economic growth, and increased tax revenues for the City of Payette. Business owners in this City are struggling, they desperately need new growth. I have reviewed the City plan that outlines the anticipated growth coming to the City, and also that the City has built out a water and sewer system that is capable of meeting this anticipated demand. Are we every going to bring economic growth to the city after this financially unfeasible to do so. For years the issue of Ductile Iron pipe vs. PVC has gone for the most part unchallenged, we have been told over and over what a great Cadillac water system we have. The reality of the situation is, is the citizens of Payette are living with poor quality of water issues, and developers have been forced to utilized the most expensive and clearly inferior building product and still try and compete with other developments in neighboring cities. Development projects in the City of Payette cost on average 10-20% more than similar developments in neighboring cities, and the City suffering because of it. Developers cannot be price competitive thus they cannot sell lots, and homes. People are moving to neighboring cities not because they don't like Payette, but because they get a better deal. It's financially impossible to be price competitive when the development taking place in the neighboring cities are not utilizing Ductile Iron water lines. Are you aware that the City of Payette already uses PVC lines for all sewer infrastructures? Is the City having problems with those lines? No, so why are we so committed to using a truly legacy and outdated water line technology like Ductile Iron. There are no compelling reasons to continue to use Ductile Iron, but there are many compelling reasons to switch to PVC. Lancaster Development has committed to bring a beautiful new 220 home community to this City. It will generate new residents that will help the local economy, and bring significant revenue to the City of Payette and schools. Without this change this project is financially impossible to build, and will be placed on hold indefinitely. We ask the City council vote to approve a variance to allow the use of PVC water line for the infrastructure and the development of Gold ridge Estates. This project could be utilized as a pilot project for the City, and once this building product has proven itself to the City Council, the Council could act to change the ordinance. City Councilors the time is now, without this change the economic future of Payette will truly be in jeopardy. We ask for your immediate action on this issue.

**Stan Clements 9948 Ash Lane, Payette, ID**

I'm the managing member of Tumbleweed Development Group, who is the developer of Two Rivers Subdivision project outside of town. I was very interested in Mr. Lancaster's paper he put together; I thought it was really quite well done. The bottom line is this, the issue of whether or not Ductile Iron pipe is better or worse than PVC is really not the factor anymore. I mean it has been used for years, it's been tested everywhere in the world and the country and we know it's just as good as Iron Ductile Pipe it's just a matter of preference. The problem is today is that we have a huge cost difference and what Gene was saying about the cost difference; I mean in his project 29 lots is \$100,000. Every other City around us is using the PVC. So we definitely have a \$3,500 per lot disadvantage. You know in the first two phases that we have done we used the Iron pipe, and at that point in time there wasn't a huge amount of difference in price. We didn't want to argue with anybody about it, it wasn't going to accomplish anything because you guys have always said were going to stay with the Iron Ductile Pipe. I'm asking you to take a completely different look at this now, because now it is a huge cost issue. With Iron going up the way it is, I mean I think it is an outdated product, and it's not just an outdated product for us here, it's a huge cost issue for the City to. As time goes on your going to have to maintain this infrastructure and when you have to buy the Ductile Iron in comparison to PVC, it's

going to cost you guys a fortune too. It's time to get on the train and get modern here, and move forward in my opinion. I would like to say one other thing; I don't think we should do this on a pilot project, because we know it's going to work. It's worked everywhere else, why wouldn't it work here. I'm asking you to take a look at this and modify your code now, so everyone can benefit from this, not just one developer or one project. We might as well just take the step and do it, and you know be done with it and move forward. I appreciate your time and glad to see all of you.

**Ray Makinson 1649 1<sup>st</sup> Ave So, Payette, ID -**

Object of this whole thing is to do the best thing for the City of Payette. The Best! I have worked for the City for 31 years, and I've done a lot of pipe in this town. When I can read the printing on the side of a pipe that is 60-70 years old, that benefits the City. The copper lines look just as good. This is what you need to stop and think about, you are here for a short amount of time, and this is a major decision that will far outlast you people. You guys don't have to maintain it. I have been here that many years. I have been through three winters of 20 below, and no one talks about how to thaw it out. I mean how do you thaw it out? I can thaw out my Ductile Iron, and my copper service line. What do I tell that customer when he's out of water? He's going to have to wait till spring? So stop and think about what you guys are doing here, because this is a major, major decision here that will far outlast you people. Please think about this. I have been here a long time, and I've dug a lot of pipe up out there. To me this is the best, this is what you want to do to benefit the city, not what benefits the contractors, not the developers, not the real estate people, the City. So that's all I have to say. Councilor Hanigan asked in your 30+ years with the City are you aware of any corrosion failure? Mr. Makinson stated he has made a lot of wet taps that means you put a saddle on it, a valve, and you can come in and tap. I wish I could have kept the coupons that came out of those, I did for years. That thing is just as thick walled as ever, I mean there are other cities that need to put PVC because it is a corrosive problem, but here for this City it is not. I have never ever had ductile iron, or cast iron fail because it rots a hole through it. I have never had a problem with the copper service line. If you want to benefit the City put that in, in the long run you will never go back to it again ever. Councilor Hanigan asked I know we flush the lines, and I know sometimes when you flush the lines it's a pretty nasty thing for a day or so. Other than the 1 or 2 day inconvenience to people, what is the cost of flushing? Mr. Makinson stated he doesn't know price wise, but for a long time we didn't flush. We have iron in the wells that is where it's coming from. It doesn't come from sitting in the line rotting the lines out; it comes from the water we put in the system. Nobody has an answer how to get rid of the iron. You look at people out of town that have brown stain on the side of their house that is from Iron. It doesn't come from rotting the pipes out, it comes from our wells. Councilor Hanigan asked so the flushing is to take care of the deposits from the well water, not from the pipe. Mr. Makinson stated right, it doesn't rot out on the inside, like I said I wish I would have kept those and showed you the coupons. There are some over at the cannery that are 1932 on side of the Cast Iron Pipe, or 1946 down here on the side of a pipe on South 9<sup>th</sup> St. Now when you can read the printing on the side of that pipe and look at that copper service line, now isn't that beneficial to the City? In the long run that is beneficial, and that's what we are talking about here, benefiting the City that is our number one project here. Councilor Heleker asked so in the 35 years you have been here, you have not known of a Ductile Iron Pipe failing in the City. Mr. Makinson stated yes, the only one that we ever had fail, was a 2", and that was because they didn't realize that it so brittle. I have never ever repaired a Ductile Iron or Cast Iron line in town because it has broken in two. I have repaired some of my transit lines that was another one where they had back in 70's asbestos lines and it breaks in two. Councilor Heleker asked when we talk about longevity of the pipe and as information had been brought to us tonight, if I can quote 4.1 on a 5.0 scale on a lifetime rating for PVC and how superior that is. You folks in our Water Department, have you done any studies to compare any of the longevity estimates that are out there. I know that PVC is generally new. Mr. Makinson stated that to me it goes back to, "what do you do in the winter time"; I mean you have to supply the people water. I have been through these, and it will happen again and there is no way of thawing it out. I don't care how well you dig it down; I have seen frost 4' down. I haven't really studied it, but all our stuff is set up for Ductile Iron

and Cast Iron. It is all set up with the fittings, and the knowledge of Ductile Iron. It's good for this town; it has lasted for a long, long time. I really hope sincerely that you stop and think about this. This is a major decision. Councilor Heleker stated so possibly when we talk about the lifetime of the pipe we would have to look at different soil samples in different communities, to see which would have an effect on Ductile Iron and which wouldn't? Mr. Makinson stated right, and a lot of towns use that because the soil is too hot. From what I have seen in the 31 years that I have been here, that is the best. Councilor Cochran asked if the City did go to PVC, Ray would we still have to do the flushing? Mr. Makinson stated I'm sure, it builds up. A good flushing program is an excellent idea, for a long time I had to go around the cannery, because every time I flushed the town it dirtied up the cannery. It shut down the poor people at the cannery, and if they didn't work they didn't get paid. So I ended up having to go around those a lot, but now they have a filter system in there and we can flush the town now. Councilor Cochran stated this picture has come around a couple of times now over the last few weeks; it's a Ductile Iron pipe or an Iron pipe that shows corrosion inside the pipe. Now you mentioned a couple of times that you can still read the dates on the outside of the pipes, have you ever seen anything that looks like this? Mr. Makinson stated no, like I said I wish I would have kept the coupon that came out of those 6-8" taps. They looked just as good on the inside as they did look on the outside, and the thickness of the walls. Councilor Heleker asked what a coupon was. Mayor Henderson stated he has a few of them sitting in his office. Mr. Makinson stated he wished you'd bring them. That is what you pull out when you do a tap, you drill through a pipe, and you pull this out and that's what's left. Councilor Heleker asked if it is just a sample of the pipe then. Mr. Makinson stated right, and we kept them for years. As a matter of fact Doug has a couple of them, and I just got to when I just didn't need them anymore so I threw them away and now I need them. Councilor Mussell asked how often we flush each line, and can you do the whole town at one time or just sections? Mr. Makinson stated that yes, last time we had the Fire Department helping us and that got us into a little bit of trouble there. We water hammered part of the old transit line and it split it from seam to seam. It's better if we just do it ourselves, if you shut it down to fast you water hammer the line. We could do it, over a period of time; it wouldn't be all at one time. It's a good time to do this, once a year would be really good. Bob talked to you, he was at it 42 years. Ivan what did he say? Councilor Mussell stated he is sold on Cast Iron. Councilor Nelson asked how old are some of these? Mr. Makinson stated I wouldn't know. I think that is a Ductile Iron line, I think 25 years at the most. That is what the iron looks like on the inside, they are cement lines. Councilor Nelson asked what the bigger one is. Mr. Makinson stated that is the Transit, that's the asbestos one that they came up with in the 70's. Councilor Mussell asked how much of that we have in the City. Mr. Makinson stated we have quite a bit up on the hill. Councilor Mussell how much 20% of the City, or what do you think? Mr. Makinson stated that so far we have had a few of it break in two, from the shift in the ground. Councilor Heleker stated Ray when you say a few of them break in town which line were you referring to? Mr. Makinson stated the Transit. We had one this spring down on 10<sup>th</sup> Ave No, and No 4<sup>th</sup> St, a 6" line shifted the ground and broke it in two. I have never had that failure in my Ductile Iron or Cast Iron pipes.

### **Chelsey Warrington 5235 S Whitley, Fruitland, ID -**

I really have no stake in this on what kind of lines you use. I have put them in for the last 30 years, so I've put in a lot of Ductile Iron, a lot of plastic lines, and the cost right now I know is a big thing. I bid a lot of jobs and just recently the Cast Iron and Ductile Iron has gone up \$10-12 a foot depending on the size. To me I wouldn't mind seeing the City stay with Ductile Iron, because it's \$10 a foot more that I put 10% on, so it's just more money I put in my pocket. Low and behold the whole thing is I think maybe it is a time the City really needs to look at changing to a plastic pipe, the C900 plastic. I put it in for 30 years, and I have not had any failures in it. The transit pipe that Ray has talked about I would highly recommend against that, most definitely. It is not a very good pipe. Copper lines too, I mean the cost right now the 1" Copper line that you would run to your house is almost \$6 a foot. For the same price now you can run an 8" plastic line. That is the difference between a 1" Copper Line and an 8" plastic line, just to show you a big difference there. You know I know that economically I

think if you want development to come, it's going to be hard for the City of Payette to charge \$60,000 for a lot compared to Fruitland or somewhere else charging you \$45,000 a lot. If you have a lot of water line infrastructure going in. The other thing, I do a lot of work for Payette, and a lot of work for other towns. I do see on plastic lines the same coupon that Ray talks about when we drill into them, ones that have been in the ground for 20 years or so. They are just like the Cast Iron lines, there is nothing wrong with them, but they don't have the scale buildup or the blister buildup in lines that have a lot of iron in them. If you have a lot of Iron in your system a lot of times your lines are not corroding on the inside, but they do get big blisters of Iron and flaking in there that I think probably do a massive flush probably build up and break off. It's hard to get out. The plastic lines are a little smoother, I mean you don't see that big build up just a little film in there is all and they just don't seem to attract the iron. In that aspect for the City of Payette they might be a pretty good deal. So like I said one way or another it doesn't matter to me. The cost and quality wise they are both the same, the fittings you use on a Ductile Iron line, are the exact same fitting you use on a plastic line. The rubbers are the same, the bolts are the same. Other than maybe a couple small items everything is interchangeable, so I mean going to a plastic line you're not restocking a bunch of things in your system that you have. In that aspect it's not a big change, but cost of handling Ductile Iron, of course the cost of installing PVC is more expensive. If you have to cut a big piece it takes twice as long to cut a piece of Ductile Iron with a hot saw compared to cutting a piece of plastic, you can buzz right through it. Whereas the Ductile Iron takes more time, a short piece of plastic you can handle by handle, Ductile Iron you have to take a chain or strap and set it in the hole with a backhoe. So it does take a little more manpower and labor to install it. Other than that there is kind of the difference between the two plastic and Ductile Iron that I see. Councilor Heleker asked you are saying that you have installed PVC pipe for 30 years, so it has been around long enough to be getting some longevity studies done on it. You say you haven't had any problems with it. Mr. Warrington stated he has worked with PVC for 30 years, and he has not had any problems with it. Councilor Heleker asked how about the thawing out question that came up, what happens when one of those pipes freeze. Mr. Warrington stated that I think that all comes to installation. I have never had anything freeze and I think that PVC to me if buried at the same depth as Ductile Iron is probably going to suck that cold into it as much as the Iron would. That all comes back to the quality control, I mean if you burry something 4' deep here, and run your service lines 4' deep out in the street, I have never seen one freeze. When you do see one that freezes, it is because a contractor has looped something up. That is 2 1/2' deep and brought it back down, then you have a spot in the street where the frost has come down, and yes plastic you can't thaw out. I mean I know Ontario has got a ton of it in the ground, Fruitland, and I have yet to hear of one to freeze up and put a customer out of business. You know if you get one customer out of business, do you want to spend another half a million over the next five years to save one customer, by putting Copper in. I don't know when the last time they had to thaw one out, but most of the time it is probably because it's been a cold winter and it thaws out between the meter and the house and it's got a shallow line to their house. Councilor Mussell asked how much training it would take if you have never put PVC in, and you've only done Ductile Iron, what would it take to get up to speed. Mr. Warrington stated none what so ever. Councilor Mussell asked they do interchange and connect to each other just fine. Mr. Warrington stated PVC will go into Ductile Iron, it will slide into the Ductile Iron bell, but a Ductile Iron bell will not slide into a PVC bell. The outside diameters of pipe are the exact same, so any fittings, sleeves, and elbows you use are the exact same size. I mean all the fitting interchange, sleeves that go around the pipe to tap pipes, to add things on saddle they are all the same size. Mayor Henderson asked so when you're laying the pipe there is no difference when you're laying new pipe between PVC and Ductile Iron. Mr. Warrington stated no, just setting them in putting some soap on the rubber and push them in the exact same way you would Ductile Iron. Councilor Mussell asked even with ground prep, do you have to prep the ground more for PVC. Mr. Warrington stated no, I think in a way PVC is a little more forgiving. In that it does have a little flex in it, where Ductile Iron if you have a little high spot, it's rigid and you have to make the ground flat.

**Peggy Tipton 1205 1<sup>st</sup> Ave So, Payette, ID -**

I'm just here with some comments. My brother Joe my partner in Real Estate now up until a year and a half ago when he joined me in Real Estate, he was the lead operator in the Water Department for the City of Weiser. When he couldn't be here tonight to provide his comments, he actually typed up something, and he gave me copies for everyone. He talks about how they did it in Weiser. PVC it takes a little bit more care when you're doing it, but once installed he believes is superior. City of Weiser made the decision to use PVC at the time because of the price difference was significant. It's also much easier to install you can triple the amount of pipe that can be laid in the ground, in a day's time. Additionally, because of the weight factor, PVC is also safer for the work force to handle. Another important consideration is that with PVC, scale does not build up on the inside of the pipe. In areas of Weiser where we had Ductile Iron pipe, we would occasionally experience a discoloration in the water. This discoloration would occur when we filled the water tank of the street sweeper. We found that iron blisters would form on the inside of the Ductile Iron pipe and then they would break loose when the sweeper operator would fill and then shut down a hydrant suddenly, causing a water hammer. The broken blisters would cause a yellowing of the water which was delivered to our customers. We even had housewives complaining about permanent stains on clothes that were laundered using the yellow water. The one factor that should be considered when making this decision is that more care must be taken to bed the pipe properly at installation. Once installed, I believe PVC to be a superior product in every way. My personal preference would be to use PVC pipe in all drinking water applications.

**Todd Stubblefield 6360 San Luis Way, Boise, ID-**

I work for United Pipe Supply, I really don't have an interest one way or another in this situation, other than I was asked to bring some information on PVC. We do sell both PVC, Ductile Iron, and HDPE, and they are all good products. As far as costs concerns go the PVC is a lot less money. Both PVC and Ductile Iron are rising at alarming rates right now. Most everything has been covered tonight that I was going to talk about this evening by the other participants; they have done a great job of explaining both sides of the situation. The Ductile Iron pipe is a great pipe, it is expensive, heavy, and it does cost more to move it around. Like they said you do get more production a day with PVC. PVC had come along ways; they just increased the pressure rating on C900, which is typically what is used for water lines. The DR18 was just increased to pressure rating 235 psi from 150. I brought some information in an information packet, some cost comparison on 6"- 8" PVC vs. class 50 and 350 Ductile. With the C900 6-8" I have some information in here that shows a little bit of history on PVC, some of the advantages on using PVC, and then I included quite a bit of information from our JM website on the C900 pipe. C900 is what would be used if switching from Ductile to PVC. Mayor Henderson asked on both PVC and Ductile Iron, being a dealer has the price stabilized on both, or do you expect both to go up. Mr. Stubblefield stated they are probably going to go up, at certain times they are going to flatten out and lower a little bit. All in all in the last few years they have basically gone down a little, but then they go right back up. Both PVC, metal, and all products is just getting astronomical and quit crazy out there. Councilor Heleker stated just staying with cost first of all, they are both going up, but can you give us a price comparison right now. Mr. Stubblefield stated that listed in the information that I gave you, I believe on the second page there is an example. I had to write the "per foot" for the C900 cause our computer prints the PVC pipe by the price per 100<sup>th</sup> foot, and the Ductile at the price per foot. It's about double; in the larger size it's a little less than double as far as the Ductile being more expensive than the PVC. It's a little more than double on the 6", and a little under on the 12". Councilor Heleker stated that you talked about the pressure rating the psi, you talked about how PVC has increased. Mr. Stubblefield stated that there are different DR classifications. For instance DR25 in the smaller sizes for C900 its 100 psi, the DR18 was 150 psi working pressure, and the DR14 was 235. The most commonly used is the DR18 with the 150 psi working pressure, throughout the whole state. The manufacturer is still working on changing some of the literature, and some of the stamping on the pipe. They just increased the pressure rating on the DR18, it's going to go from 150 -235 psi. Councilor Heleker asked if he could compare that to Ductile

Iron. Mr. Stubblefield stated that Ductile Iron I believe is about 350 psi. Ductile Iron is a great pipe, its strong stuff, and it's heavy but PVC is a good pipe to. On an average we probably sell it 70 – 80% PVC over Ductile Iron, and I'm going to say the majority of that is a cost issue. Mayor Henderson asked if there was no cost involved which one would you choose/recommend. Mr. Stubblefield stated that it would be hard for him to say because they are both good pipe, but me personally if I had to install it I would go with the PVC. It's lighter, easier to use, and there are other cost issues other than just the actual materials itself. It's easier on the material, as well as easier on the guys. Like Chelsea was saying you use for the most part all the same fittings. Councilor Nelson asked if there was any feedback from the customers/municipalities on what their experiences have been when they order replacement products. Mr. Stubblefield stated that like he said it's a person preference, there are towns that have always used Ductile Iron, and always will be. We see more and more going to PVC, some even going to the HDPE, and that's a whole different animal. We haven't had any complaints from the people that use PVC. The guys that like the Ductile like it for the reasons they like it. Councilor Heleker stated that brings back to mind the issue we've talked about before on the corrosion, and the fact that our soil here in the community seems to be such that it doesn't cause so much corrosion in a Ductile Iron pipe. In selling to different communities have you found that to be true? Have you found that certain communities can use the Ductile and certain can't, and those that can use it do it? Mr. Stubblefield stated yes, there are. There are areas that have been mentioned that have hot soil, more corrosive soil. In certain cities they use a combination of both for different application; maybe in a shallower bury they will use Ductile Iron. Some of them have switched from PVC for going into buildings, running through vaults, if there is sleeve in pipe in steel casings. I haven't seen any switch from PVC to Ductile. I've only been in the business for 15 years, so they were using PVC when I got here and I'm sure they will be using it long after I go. Councilor Nelson asked who would be the expert; these are made from Petroleum products. If you read these plastic bottles now they're saying if you leave them out in the sun it releases toxins, carcinogens, fluorocarbons, or something like that. Does PVC have similar products, similar ingredients. I mean so that 30 years down the road where they haven't come across it yet, but will it. Mr. Stubblefield stated that they have been using it for about 40 years. I'm not an expert or an engineer, but I haven't heard of anything in that regard. As far as it being buried I don't think it gives off anything, it's pretty resistant to household chemicals. By looking at the coupons you seem to have some pretty clean water. Typically with PVC a selling point would be you have less friction loss, because it is smooth inside, and it's more difficult to have a buildup. As far as it giving off anything toxic or anything, I couldn't really answer that question. I don't think so, but then again I don't know and I haven't heard of anything.

### **Rob Woyak 1010 No 6<sup>th</sup> St, Payette, ID**

Council and Mayor, a lot of good stuff said tonight. I'm sure we could sit here and go back and forth at each other's opinions and tear each other apart. I don't intend to do that. You have packets, and you have heard both sides. Some of the things cost, you bet. I'm not one for spending money; I'm very tight with my budget. I don't waste it, I don't spend it frivolously, but some of the things that were not brought up. Where Mr. Lancaster is preparing to develop, you may not have got this in your packet, but permeation of PVC. There is also a problem where soils contained with hydrocarbon, such as gasoline or other chemicals are encountered, plastic pipe walls and gasket materials are susceptible to permeation that can damage the material and contaminate the water. In a study conducted by the Sanitary Engineering and Environmental Health Research Laboratory at the University of California Berkley, PVC was reported to be involved in 15% of the permeation incident found in a literature search found in the United States. Now we all know that east of Starks Dairy the old Payette Dump sits, all buried over for a lot of years. Rob stated I for one dumped thousands of gallons of solvents and thinners when I worked for Manser Ford. Idaho Power dumped transformers with PCB, and there is a lot of waste up there. Our aquifers flows sort of that direction so with them saying that permeation of the pipe makes me kind of leery. You know we are starting to live in a green world where people want everything to be good and healthy. There are a lot of chemicals in PVC. Did you know that lead

is used as a plasticizer, and cadmium? I don't know when that stuff starts to break down from the outside in, not a good thing. My responsibility and I'm sorry that I provide such poor water, I did not know that. We test our water every month. We test monthly for lots of stuff, SOC's, and VOC's. You can only do so much, and believe me my crew and I do the best we can. One of the things is cost. In 1975 we came across this in our shop, ¾ type K copper was \$2.00 a foot compared to 2008 which is \$4.46 a foot. \$2.46 in 33 years, seems to me prices go up for everything. I do agree Ductile Iron is expensive, but then again you get what you pay for. If they are telling me that PVC does not build up, this is a piece of ductile pipe and this is a piece of PVC pipe. This came out of a water line that was in Seneca. They happen to hit the water line and broke it, if it would have been Ductile Iron it wouldn't have broke. Councilor Mussell asked if we allowed PVC at one point in the City. Mr. Woyak stated that Seneca has it because they are in charge of their own stuff. PVC still builds up and yes I will agree ductile does to, but if you'll see it is a cement line and it doesn't rust from the inside out. Councilor Mussell asked what the oldest piece of Ductile Iron that was clear. Mr. Woyak stated probably 30 years old at the most. One of those coupons is fairly old. If you guys want to see the durability strength of it, we can do that outside if you want. I guarantee you one smack with that sledge hammer and that PVC will shatter. One of the things that do concern me is the leaching and bleeding of the PVC. It's a lot of stuff they don't want to tell you. Go online you can find stuff about PVC facts, people are trying to phase this out worldwide. Some of the things that go into PVC are phthalates, lead cadmium, plasticizers, and they will leach out. Some of the causes are cancer, indecorum disruptor, endometriosis, neurological damage, birth defects, reproduction, immune system damage, and that is just a few. With everything towards the green, a lot of places are phasing it our or trying to. Just another thought to consider is where this is going to be located and what's east of it. They are both good products they really are, and I'm not going to pick PVC apart as the Ductile and the Copper have been. That is their choice, and I don't play that way.

#### **Jeff Sands 2071 Kelly Dr, Payette, ID**

I'll just discuss the flushing issue a little bit. Fruitland flushes theirs, they are mainly plastic and they flush once a year. There has been a lot of good information tonight. The buildup of the pipes we always get the screaming from this, but keep in mind you're not turning on ¾ inch taps and running your water out of it. When we hook on to it were sucking 1500 gallons maybe 3500 gallons out of that line. It goes from on the hill 120 psi to 20, so it goes from being able to push that much out, down to only going to some of the lower areas go down to zero. We teeter on the line of actually being able to suck the line out of the ground if we don't keep an eye on the hoses. That is when you bust that stuff loose that is in there, and it's because they don't get flushed a lot. I mean we can go to Boise Cascade right now and open that hydrant up, wide open right of the port it will be clear as a bell, but it gets used every day. We fill out trucks off that hydrant, so you have isolated hydrants around that may not get used for a long, long time. So that falls back into maintenance issue, now keep in mind our system has 348 hydrants vs. Fruitland that has around 150-160. So it takes a lot more to flush this system than it does that system when you think of the maintenance. It's easy to say why we don't have a flushing program, but remember there are only three guys here trying to do 300 and some hydrants. I'm not picking sides with anyone I'm just telling you it doesn't get flushed that frequently, and that's where a lot of that dirty water comes from. You're going to get it with plastic and you're going to get it with iron because I've turned on hydrants all over this valley. If they haven't been turned on in a while they are going to bust a little rust loose.

#### **Doug Argo 7998 Bilburns Rd, Emmett, ID**

Good evening Council. The people have presented a couple sides of this argument. PVC is a good pipe, or at least it's good at conveying water. There are some issues that are unknown about it, and they're starting to come out, that are serious for consideration. The leaching of the carcinogens into the pipe; they have documented that now in warm climates such as Arizona. They are studying the actual impacts of that, but it is leaching harmful carcinogens into the pipe system as it's buried in the

ground for public distribution. Solvents and hydrocarbons are shown to have penetrated the pipe when it's in the ground, and that is a concern that is still being researched. The jury is still out as to whether its and actual threat to public health or not. It hasn't been very many years ago that AC pipe and that is the asbestos concrete pipe. That was approved for use, and now DEQ has issued a directive to all the operators where you have an opportunity get this stuff out of your system. They have said there is nothing yet on PVC, but the yet is a very ominous word. They are researching it and the jury is still out, we don't know if this stuff is a long term health issue. 5 years ago these plastic water bottles they thought there was absolutely no problem with them what so ever. Now it's turning out we have an issue. The health issues are unknown as of yet, but they are a dark cloud over top of the pipe. The City of Spokane in addition to the solvent issues and the leaching issues they have a ductile and cast iron system, they don't have a PVC system. They were ordered by Washington State Department of Ecology to take over a small water system that was PVC and that's the only stuff they have in their system now. Their reasoning is the life cycle costs; there is ductile iron pipe in the US that has been in the ground for over 200 years still in service. There is pipe in Europe that is over 500 years old that is still in service, and its cast iron. The difference between cast iron and ductile iron is the cement lining that Rob showed you on the pipe. The cement gives added protection inside. Again, the City of Spokane said the way they are viewing it ductile iron their certain has well over 100 years of service life. They do not think PVC will go over 70 years; probably not that much but they don't know for sure it hasn't been around that long. By the time you get your second instillation in on the PVC you blown way past the initial cost difference. Because we have focused on just the material costs, we haven't focused on the labor cost, or the back fill cost. Whatever kind of pipe whenever you dig it out you have to replace it put the soil back in, patch the road if it's got a road over it, or whatever. When you come back in and do that with your road overtop you put the pipe in, in new construction and you build your road over top. If you ever have to replace that pipe your costs go up on the trenching, and they go up dramatically, because you have to deal with traffic control, and the shutdown of the system. So the second time you have to replace the pipe is more cost than the initial construction. The City of Tacoma, I didn't have a chance to get all the detail because I just learned about this, this morning. They have a large PVC replacement project going on now, and when I get that information I will bring it back and share it with you some point in the future. I don't know why they are replacing it, just that they are replacing it with ductile. That's all I have for you tonight.

Attorney Bert Osborn stated that it is 7:00 and it is time for your regular meeting to start, and I think we are going to have to cancel the demonstration. Mayor Henderson asked Mr. Osborn if he could call a recess and we could go out in the parking lot and hit the pipe could we. Mr. Osborn stated yes.

Public Hearing adjourned at 7:00

## **7:00 Regular Meeting**

A regular meeting of the Payette City Council was called to order at 7:05 PM by Mayor Henderson in the City Council Chambers of Payette City Hall, 700 Center Avenue.

### **ROLL CALL**

Members Present: Mayor Henderson, Ivan Mussell, Jeff Williams, Mark Heleker, Georgia Hanigan, Lee Nelson, Les Cochran

Members Absent: None

Also Present: Police Chief Mark Clark; City Engineer Doug Argo; Police Captain Dave Platt; Mary Cordova, City Coordinator/Clerk; Tiffany Howell Utility Clerk, Randy Schwartz; Wastewater Superintendent, Jeff Sands; Fire Chief, Rob Woyak; Water Superintendent

**PLEDGE**

Mayor Henderson led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Williams moved and Heleker seconded a motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of 07/7/2008.

After a unanimous voice vote by the Council, the motion CARRIED.

**APPROVAL OF BILLS & PAYROLL**

A motion was made by Hanigan and seconded by Williams to approve the City Bills & Payroll in the amount of \$ 379,731.31

At the roll call:

Ayes: Nelson, Mussell, Hanigan, Williams, Heleker, Cochran

Nays:

The motion CARRIED.

**SPECIAL ORDERS**

None Heard.

**COMMUNICATIONS**

No comments heard.

**PLANNING & ZONING**

None Heard.

**OLD BUSINESS**

**A. Motion to Award Bid for WWTP Dump Truck to Lake City**

As asked by the Council at our last meeting concerning the matter of replacing the Wastewater Department sludge truck. We have provided you information relating to the buying of a used truck vs. a new one. While the data for purchasing a used truck shows an overall cost slightly lower than new. There does not appear enough difference at least in my opinion to take the chance on a used vehicle over a new. Councilor Nelson asked if the couple bids that were presented last time are in the packets. Randy Schwartz stated no. We were just providing some information on what we ran across on the internet. Councilor Nelson asked what the original bid was. Mary Cordova stated the original bid from Lake City was \$131,835. Councilor Williams stated that no fingers being pointed at anybody, but if this data was with our packet last month maybe it would have expedited this.

A motion was made by Williams and seconded by Cochran to approve the bid for the new truck for the Wastewater department.

At the roll call:

Ayes: Nelson, Mussell, Hanigan, Williams, Heleker, Cochran

Nays:

The motion CARRIED.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

### **A. Special Event Permit**

#### **~Cruise Night, Payette Chamber of Commerce**

Jodi Clements 2303 North Crest Drive, Boise, ID

Linda Williams 1438 2<sup>nd</sup> Ave So, Payette, ID

Jim Boyer 340 So Main, Payette, ID

Jody Clements stated are requesting that you waive the special event fees for the A & W Cruise Night. The Chamber is sponsoring Friday night, and we are sponsoring the chili cook off, with a car show on Saturday. We are requesting that Main Street be closed, and we have provided maps with our application. We would also like a donation for the payment of the port-a-potties, which is right around \$800. Councilor Cochran asked Mary the balance in our donation line item. Ms. Cordova stated it is \$349. 91 left. Mayor Henderson asked what the bill was for last year. Ms. Cordova stated it was \$750. Councilor Williams asked if we have any way of knowing what the income is from outside people, and do we quantify that. We have an Economic Development line item and this line item might be able to fund this function. Jim Boyer stated we have 250 cars on Friday night last year, and I would expect 300-350 this year on Friday night times 3 would be an easy number. As far as other people were looking at 2,000 people Friday, and Saturday in the park probably 3,000 people pretty easy that are in and out. Everyone on Main Street get a portion of the revenue. Councilor Hanigan asked Mary what the park fees would be. Ms. Cordova stated it would be \$100 per park and whatever the per diem fee, so it would be \$200 basically. Councilor Hanigan stated that personally from my view point I would rather not waive the park fees, and increase our donation. I think we set our park fees, and we did it for a very good reason, and there are a lot of parks for this event being used. Councilor Cochran stated I agree with what Councilor Hanigan said. It seems to be two separate issues, it think we have set a pretty good precedence in the past not to waive the fees, but I think we probably should think about donating this because it is the most special events that Payette puts on. Jim has gone out of his way to make sure that even though we have opened this up for some alcohol use, he has policed the City and made it a nice dream for us. I think we should not waive fees, but support the program. Councilor Mussell stated that as a manager of one of the local business I know how much it benefits the local businesses when you're event goes on. I'm for helping out, but I will tell you of names and numbers of port-a-potty outfits. Right now the economy is down and they are willing to deal. I agree, I think it would be good to stick with the fees, and upping the donation. Councilor Williams stated that several years ago you requested a flat donation and I think the County was involved in matching that. Is the County still involved in that at all, this is a whole County event and it brings a lot of money into the area? Mr. Boyer stated that Yes

they are going to donate \$2,000 for advertising only. Ms. Cordova stated that we do not have the "no parking" signs to close off the streets. Mr. Boyer stated he has those. Councilor Cochran asked Attorney Osborn if he is ok on using the Economic development line item. Mr. Osborn stated yes. Councilor Heleker asked what the balance was. Mayor Henderson stated it was \$7,500. Councilor Mussell does anyone remember what we did with the county. Mayor Heleker stated that last year they provided the port-a-potties.

A motion was made by Hanigan and seconded by Cochran to contribute \$1,000 to Cruise Night to use as they see fit from our Economic Development Fund.

At the roll call:

Ayes: Nelson, Mussell, Hanigan, Williams, Heleker, Cochran

Nays:

The motion CARRIED.

Heleker moved and Mussell seconded a motion to approve the Special Events Permit Application for A&W Cruise Night and Car Show for September 5<sup>th</sup>, an 6<sup>th</sup>, 2008.

After a unanimous voice vote by the Council, the motion CARRIED.

## **B. Special Event Permit ~Wedding in Central Park**

Mayor Henderson stated that they are asking to waive the park fee. The mother is handicap and could not come, but I think it's something we should consider for someone who is only there for 3 or 4 hours.

Cochran moved and Hanigan seconded a motion to approve the Special Events Permit Application, but not waive the permit fee.

At the roll call:

Ayes: Nelson, Mussell, Hanigan, Williams, Heleker, Cochran

Nays:

The motion CARRIED.

## **C. Appointment of Impact Fee Advisory Committee**

We need to establish a Development Impact Fee Advisory Committee. Some of the Cities are using the P&Z committee because they are knowledgeable with the issues, and it seems to be an easier way to keep things on course. The resolution before you 2008-16 is to establish our P&Z committee as our Development Fee

Advisory Committee. Councilor Williams stated that on paragraph 5 it states that at least two people should not be officials of a Government agency. Are we covering our basis here? Mayor Henderson asked if the P&Z members are members of a Government agency. Mr. Osborn stated they are appointed by the City. Councilor Williams stated that he has no problem with these people, but do we need to add two more. Mayor Henderson stated it was a valid point and it was suggested to us that we could use the P&Z committee. Mayor Henderson asked Ms. Cordova if we needed to re-visit this. Ms. Cordova stated no, but if Mr. Osborn thinks we should re-visit it. Councilor Williams asked if it would just be easier to add two people to the committee. Mayor Henderson stated he is not opposed to doing so.

Williams moved and Mussell seconded a motion to approve Resolution 2008-16 adding Alan Massey and Jeff Ward as member to the fore stated committee.

At the roll call:

Ayes: Nelson, Mussell, Hanigan, Williams, Heleker, Cochran

Nays:

The motion CARRIED.

**C. Matt Youngberg, 2091 Shelley Dr, Payette, ID  
~Eagle Scout Project**

I'm a life scout I want to be an Eagle Scout and I need a project to get there. What I was planning to do was re-do the airport parking lot, and turn it into grass and moving the carport over. Councilor Nelson asked how big the lawn area is. Mr. Youngberg stated it was 50'x20'. Mayor Henderson asked where the carport is going to go. Mr. Youngberg stated that it would be going 10' to the right. Councilor Williams asked if there were any thoughts as to putting in bumpers so people wouldn't drive through your fence. Matt Youngberg stated yes that is a good idea. Ms. Cordova stated that there is a concern that you won't be able to get heavy trucks through for future construction. Heavy trucks need to have a permanent access, that way it would have a less impact on the taxi away. Councilor Nelson asked if the carport has encroached on access. Mayor Henderson stated no. Mayor Henderson stated maybe you should turn the carport so there is still an access. Is the Airport Committee behind you on this project? Mr. Youngberg stated yes, they are donating some money. Councilor Nelson asked if the city approves this, what the cost would be to us. Mr. Youngberg stated about 120' of black pipe.

Williams moved and Heleker seconded a motion to approve the Eagle Scout Project.

After a unanimous voice vote by the Council, the motion CARRIED.

**E. Approval of Police Policy Manual**

Councilor Heleker asked Mr. Clark who the chief executive officer is. Mr. Clark stated he is. Councilor Heleker asked who the designated media representative is.

Chief Clark stated we have a couple of people who are designated. Mr. Heleker stated that pages 269-279 are upside down.

Heleker moved and Williams seconded a motion to approve the Payette Police Department Manual.

At the roll call:

Ayes: Nelson, Hanigan, Williams, Heleker, Cochran

Nays: Mussell (Abstained)

The motion CARRIED.

## **DEPARTMENTAL REPORTS**

### A. Building Inspector – Revenue vs. Expense Report

Councilor Cochran stated as you see the fee net revenue cost are services are all different numbers, I would like to have someone tell me what the deal is with the plan review costs. What is highlighted on the second page is that the total for revenue for plan review. Mayor Henderson stated that we are in the black on those pages. Ms. Cordova stated the fee is a fee for building permits. I don't know what permit number we started assigning permit numbers, but  $\frac{3}{4}$  of this page were done with the other building inspector. Doug Argo stated that the total fee charges have the review fee in there. These are starting back to the 1<sup>st</sup> of the year. The fee is a building permit fee; very few have the fee, because they were initiated at the 1<sup>st</sup> of the year. The cost of services and the cost billed to date. The numbers are not final they are just intermediate numbers. We still have outstanding work yet to be done. Net revenue is the net between the fees collected and fee we have collected for those services and the amount remaining in that account. That is money that is yet to be asserted in the comment. Councilor Cochran asked if I come to your office would you assess this and charge me \$441.50. Mr. Argo state that this money is for the permit, and then at cost of service and you are going to - \$93, is the cost of services. Doug Argo stated you pay \$441 and the City pays us for our services. That is the cost of services what the City is paying for our services. The net revenue is whatever is left over. The fee paid by the user the City takes a portion and pays Holladay and the rest stays in City hoper. Councilor Mussell asked how long does it take for them to expire. Doug Argo stated 180 days of non work. Councilor Williams asked what the \$600 second to last is on the page. Ms. Cordova stated those are bills we have not received form Holladay's. Councilor Williams asked so we probably need to look at some of these that we inherited we didn't have don's salary in there. Ms. Cordova stated that realistically you looking at around \$2,000. Councilor Cochran asked is this the quarterly review. Ms. Cordova stated yes. Councilor Cochran asked but there are not very many review fees. Ms. Cordova stated correct, it went into effect in April of 2008. Councilor Mussell asked what the formula is, that is being used to calculate these fees. Mr. Argo stated it is based on construction costs and a small set fee of \$25-50 dollars, as well as the value of project. Councilor Cochran asked so the plan review fees come from building inspectors office after he reviews and accepts them. Doug, so the plan review fee is a fixed percentage. Mr. Argo stated yes. Councilor Cochran asked when is he charging for the review fee. Mr. Argo stated at the time the permit is granted.

Councilor Cochran asked are impact fees going to be assessed on the new residence. Councilor Williams stated yes. Councilor Cochran asked is our building inspector getting \$3,000 a month, plus a fee to review the plans, plus an impact fee. Councilor Williams stated that the impact fees will be assessed to the developers. Councilor Cochran stated I have not really understood this whole thing since I came on the Council; we are making some assessments on our community. Councilor Cochran stated he would like to see an open council on this review fee.

B. Treasurer's Report – June 2008; Quarterly Financial Report

C. Engineering Status Report

### **CITIZENS COMMENTS**

Justin Walker, Middleton Idaho.

I am here on behalf of Keller Associates. We would just like to reintroduce ourselves to you and would be pleased to do work for the City.

Gail Jacobs, Payette, ID

Mr. Jacobs stated he has lived here since 1962. Part of what I wanted to do was listen to the building permit fee that was discussed. The economy is down everywhere. I really feel that we want to look really hard in allowing progress in our committee. Every one of my contractors is having to get jobs with other people because they cannot afford the permit fees. I think we really need to look this over and see what we are adding to this permit fees. We are supposed to want business in our City. My business is down and down quite a bite, I have 10 employees and I have never had to lay any off, but I'm getting real close.

### **MAYOR'S COMMENTS**

- Work session for the proposed budget is on 7/24 from 4-6.
- Our next Council meeting is August 4, 2008 at 7:00pm.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

A motion was made by Heleker and seconded by Mussell to adjourn.

After a unanimous voice vote, the motion CARRIED, and the Council adjourned at 8:10PM.

Signed this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2008.

\_\_\_\_\_  
DOUGLAS E. HENDERSON, Mayor

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Mary Cordova, City Clerk

